

---

**From:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 20, 2015 12:06 AM  
**To:** jeffrey E.  
**Subject:** RE: Re:

I don't see where that gets us. Everything is generated, ultimately, by the same sources. But we still want to understand the nature of the visual, immune, enteric nervous, linguistic, etc., systems.

From: jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com]  
Sent: Monday, October 19, 2015 7:22 PM  
To: Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
Subject: Re:

but the words are generated by chemical electrical actions. . nothing more. there is no make believe force. . go to the source.

On Mon, Oct 19, 2015 at 7:06 PM, Noam Chomsky [REDACTED] > wrote:

She is great, great, great. But for the moment, roles reversed. Valeria tore a muscle lifting something that she shouldn't have. Had to call off our trip. Last one was called off because I broke a rib. Maybe the next one because our dog will have a nervous breakdown.

It's certainly true that there are all kinds of information transfer. Human language, a particular biological object, can also be used for this purpose (though it is hard to comprehend the common claim that this is its "function"). Suppose, however, that we limit ourselves to organ-to-organ signaling. Would it be appropriate to ask why chemical signals are not "merely a signal for internal use", just like electrical, linguistic, other? I don't think so. We would want to know what chemical signals are and how they work, and the same for electrical, linguistic, etc. They are all radically different, and their particular nature is the object of inquiry into them.

And again, linguistic systems are radically different from the others in that signaling is only one of many uses of language, statistically speaking (for what that's worth, probably not much) a very minor one. And crucially, investigation of the nature of language has, I think, yielded mounting and significant evidence that in the design of language externalization altogether is a peripheral property, largely a reflex of whatever sensory modality is used, hence special uses such as communication even more so.

From: jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com <mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com> ]

Sent: Monday, October 19, 2015 1:23 PM

To: Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>

Subject:

cells signal each other by various means. . chemical gas . electrical, . , multicellular other chemicals. wider range of signals.

some sigals internal some external. . why is not " language merely a signal for internal use . organ to organ, sense to sense. the eyes telling nose where to turn. etc. . and then it gets vocalized for external signalling as part of a repertoire. gesture prosody etc. is there a universal vocalization , OW for example, when pain sensors engage? and vocalize as a by product of the info transfer. . I love to see how your wife takes care of you. great great great

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE

Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com) <<mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com>> , and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com) <<mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com>> , and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved