

---

**From:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**Sent:** Monday, July 11, 2016 12:09 AM  
**To:** jeffrey E.  
**Cc:** Valeria Chomsky  
**Subject:** Re:

What is better for thought than e=ht Jewish delicatessen food. Glatt kosher, I hope.

Very=interesting experiment. It might tell us a lot about musical genres =nd their underlying structure, and the cognitive capacities that organize =hought, creativity, and experience in these apparently human-specific ways=

On blind children, you might want to look at the fascinating=study by Landau and Gleitman on the language of the blind: Language and=Experience: evidence from blind children (or something like that). =A0 What is striking is that without visual experience, the blind learn lan=usage virtually in parallel with sighted children, with the same changes th=t plainly have to do with maturation and the very specific internal concep=s of human cognition, leading finally to understanding of extremely refine= visual concepts, all with only minimal experience that can't be direc=ing these developments any more than the nutrition of the embryo, while ob=iously necessary for development, can determine that we have a mammalian r=ther than visual system. There are also some quite intriguing differ=nces. E.g., at the age when sighted children acquire the words/conce=ts see, look at, etc., blind children also do, but necessarily give=a tactile rather than visual interpretation. So for the blind child,=to look at something is to touch it, and to see it is to grasp what it is.=C2 The child is therefore surprised to find that its mother cannot see =he back of the dolls they are holding, since the child can. Lots of =results like these.

What is particularly striking, however, is=how similar the cognitive growth is to normal physical growth, of course e=icitied by experience but then substantially following its internally deter=ined path. The widely-held belief that cognitive development is some=ow different from the rest of biology in that it is experience-determined =s, I think, a residue of traditional dualism -- a kind of "methodolog=cal dualism," which is, I think, more pernicious than traditional met=physical dualism, which, in fact, was quite serious and reasonable science=at the time.

Long story.

Noam

On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 8:=6 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com <mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com>> wrote:

happy to provide some carnegie =eli sustenance for thought.

today I conducted an experiment encouraged by Noam's wholly jus=ified aggressive and detailed directives to joscha. . . =C2 joshcha focused on layers being developed in the =rain . the timing for the development of each layer being diff=rent per species .

I postulate that music might be a frosted window into that structure. symphonies begin with their first "layer" a theme. in fact , there might be more than one theme in the first layer , =A0 , the second part of symphonic form is the complex development stage= where those themes are inverted, deconstructed , reconstructed =tc ,and the development stage takes the most time . in =the conclusion of the symphonic form the recapitulation of all that has come b=fore it forms a "phenomena of the piece " a whole ,made up of its smaller concepts . =C2 As opposed to listening to music to record which neuron is firing, as most musicians attempt . I propose that the music may be the audible result =f those neurons firing, made possible by a select few who would attempt=20 to notate those neuronal firings. Beethoven f=r example.

The experiment . I mashed all o= the four symphonies together , playing recordings of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlayed on each other, playing at the same time. - the way a brain might develop. I expected an ordered noise but to the surprising cont=ary , IT WAS AMAZING. . you can hear new =A0 "concepts " forming,

il wonder whether in the mind of a blind child , the "music" would be created even without the visual ref=rencial. but created none the less. later when the visual c=n be tied to concepts , the anatomy may be hijacked to produce sounds . that someh=w relate to the concepts. .

I tried to mix mu=ic from different cultures- it didn't work. African =oes not work with western europe,- chinese works with neither of the other two. but within the same cultu=al music ( the brain of the local species ) the mash ups are=20 beautiful.

I would note=20 that computers engage in "parallel processing" only in orde= to take a hard problem and break it into its component parts , working on each component separately, , here each problem Interacts =and the their resolutions interact in remarkable ways.

--

--

=A0 please note

The information=contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client=privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for=br>the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE =nauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any par= thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com <mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com> , and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -al= rights reserved