

---

**From:** Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]>  
**Sent:** Monday, July 11, 2016 2:40 PM  
**To:** Jeffrey E.  
**Cc:** Valeria Chomsky  
**Subject:** Re:

Well, equivalent is too strong, but similar in fundamental ways: like all biological processes, genetic factors and general physical laws lead to fairly specific outcomes, with experience triggering and in a limited way guiding the process.

So it seems.

On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 10:24 PM, Jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com <mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com>> wrote: >  
equivalent to walking? <=r>

On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 10:17 PM, Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]> wrote:

My fault for being too aggressive. =C2♦ I should have been more sensitive to the situation.

Intresting image, but (as you know), I think the specific character of cognitive (like physical) growth requires more specific mechanisms.

There have incidentally been studies of "motherese" (the kinds of talk used by mothers to babies) and the impact on development of language. =C2♦ Turns out to be very slight, if any. Lila Gleitman, co-author of the work on blind children that I mentioned, is one of the leading researchers on the topic.

=div class="gmail\_quote">>On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 8:34 PM, Jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com <mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com>> wrote:

yes- more of the story sitting in the Caribbean I hope. Its possible that the DNA writes a score. ♦=A0 the music is played on both the internal instrument and modified by external experience. I believe a pleasant harmony might represent the voice of the mother. to inhibit excitation ♦=A0( basic patterns, like lullabies, use humming =here dissonance might represent an alarm or something to stimulate the adrenals. baby crying, dissonance =issonance, - family members harmony, . could it be that the humming of m ( lullaby ) and the exhalation of ah. would combine in an effort to mimic the internal harmony, producing mah. or mom. ? . how is it=that the melody of "pop goes the weasel." has a simple grammar but a child can tell immediately if a "non grammatical" note is played. adults can also tell instantaneously =C2♦in a Mozart symphony of thousands upon

thousands of notes. tha=a clunker made it way in ( okok, maybe you=cant ) due to the intra relation of the notes.  
=C2◆

FYI. thank you for being patient with =he boy who forgot to take his asperger meds/ ◆=A0 ( true). .

On Sun, Jul 10, 2016 at 8:08 PM, Noam=Chomsky  
<[REDACTED]> wrote:

What is better for =hought than echt Jewish delicatessen food. Glatt kosher, I hope.  
=br>

Very interesting experiment. It might tell us a lot about m=sical genres and their underlying structure, and the cognitive capacities =hat organize thought, creativity, and experience in these apparently human=specific ways.

On blind children, you might want to look at t=e fascinating study by Landau and Gleitman on the language of the blind: <=>Language and Experience: evidence from blind children (or something l=ke that). What is striking is that without visual experience, the bl=nd learn language virtually in parallel with sighted children, with the sa=e changes that plainly have to do with maturation and the very specific in=ernal concepts of human cognition, leading finally to understanding of ext=emely refined visual concepts, all with only minimal experience that can&#=9;t be directing these developments any more than the nutrition of the emb=yo, while obviously necessary for development, can determine that we have = mammalian rather than visual system. There are also some quite intr=guing differences. E.g., at the age when sighted children acquire th= words/concepts see, look at, etc., blind children also do, but nec=ssarily give a tactile rather than visual interpretation. So for the=blind child, to look at something is to touch it, and to see it is to gras= what it is. The child is therefore surprised to find that its mothe= cannot see the back of the dolls they are holding, since the child can.=C2◆ Lots of results like these.

What is particularly striki=g, however, is how similar the cognitive growth is to normal physical grow=h, of course elicited by experience but then substantially following its i=ternally determined path. The widely-held belief that cognitive deve=opment is somehow different from the rest of biology in that it is experie=ce-determined is, I think, a residue of traditional dualism -- a kind of &=uot;methodological dualism," which is, I think, more pernicious than =traditional metaphysical dualism, which, in fact, was quite serious and rea=onable science at the time.

Long story.

Noam  
=/div>

On Sun, Jul=10, 2016 at 8:46 AM, jeffrey E. <jeevacation@gmail.com  
<mailto:je=vacation@gmail.com> >=wrote:

happy to provide=some carnegie deli sustenance for thought. <=r>

today I conducted an experiment encouraged by Noam's=C2◆ wholly justified aggressive and detailed directives to joscha<=span>.. joshcha focused on layers being de=veloped in the brain . the timing for the development of each layer=C2◆ being different per species .

I postulate that music might be a frosted window into that structure. symphonies begin with their first "layer" a theme. in fact , there might be more than one theme in the first layer , the second part of symphonic form is the complex development stage where those themes are inverted, deconstructed , reconstructed ,and the development stage takes the most time . in the conclusion of the symphonic form the recapitulation of all that has come before it forms a "phenomenon of the piece" a whole ,made up of its smaller concepts . As opposed to listening to music to record which neuron is firing, as most musicians attempt . I propose that the music may be the audible result of those neurons firing, made possible by a select few who would attempt to notate those neuronal firings. Beethoven for example.

The experiment . I mashed all of the four symphonies together , playing recording of the 3rd 5th 6th 7th all overlayed on each other, playing at the same time. - the way a brain might develop. I expected an ordered noise but to the surprising contrary , IT WAS AMAZING. . you can hear new "concepts" forming,

I wonder whether in the mind of a blind child , the "music" would be created even without the visual reference. but created none the less. later when the visual can be tied to concepts , the anatomy may be hijacked to produce sounds . that somehow relate to the concepts. .

I tried to mix music from different cultures- it didn't work. African does not work with western europe, chinese works with neither of the other two. but within the same cultural music ( the brain of the local species ) the mash ups are beautiful.

I would note that computers engage in "parallel processing" only in order to take a hard problem and break it into its component parts , working on each component separately, here each problem interacts and their resolutions interact in remarkable ways.

--

--

◆=A0 please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client-privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of

JEE

Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com)

<mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com> , and

destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--  
=C2♦ please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE  
Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com), and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--  
♦=A0 please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE  
Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com) <<mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com>>, and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved