

---

**From:** Noam Chomsky [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 24, 2015 3:52 PM  
**To:** jeffrey E.  
**Subject:** RE: Re:

This is the program David Marr initiated, developed by Shimon Ullman and others. Makes sense, and there are some interesting results. David was a friend, and we often discussed these topics. In fact, his famous three levels adapted a model from generative grammar. But there was always the fundamental problem I mentioned. Vision is an input system, crafting coherent images from lines, points of light, etc. Language is used for that purpose too, but it's not what language is.

That fundamental difference, along with the fact that the principles involved seem quite different, has always been a stumbling block to seeking any link.

**From:** jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com]  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 24, 2015 10:48 AM  
**To:** Noam Chomsky [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Re:

Vision rules needed to craft coherent image . Edges? " Faggehtabowtit." Two edges crafted by software

On Thursday, December 24, 2015, Noam Chomsky <[REDACTED]> wrote:

I presume that the software just guides the hardware. Don't see how that changes the considerations.

**From:** jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com <javascript:\_e(%7B%7D,'cvml','jeevacation@gmail.com');> ]  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 24, 2015 10:09 AM  
**To:** Noam Chomsky [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Re:

The hardware of vision is an input system , It's the software that I'm referring to .

On Thursday, December 24, 2015, Noam Chomsky [REDACTED]<[REDACTED]> wrote:

We don't teach children language either, contrary to many beliefs. The visual grammar just grows, and as is known, can develop in various ways depending on early experience. Same with the language grammar, though the period in which experience has a shaping effect is much longer.

However, there are fundamental differences between vision and language. Can send you a recent paper about it if you like. Vision is an input system. Language isn't. It's an internal capacity, a system of knowledge, which is used to process input and also to produce thoughts (sometimes externalized). Seems also to be modality independent. And their properties look wholly different, so it's hard to see how one could piggy-back on the other.

Noam

From: jeffrey E. [mailto:[jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com)]  
Sent: Thursday, December 24, 2015 9:24 AM  
To: Noam Chomsky [REDACTED] >>; [martin\\_nowak@harvard.edu](mailto:martin_nowak@harvard.edu)  
<[REDACTED]>  
Subject:

we dont teach children to see. they have a visual grammar built in . why wouldnt we expect some mutation of that system to allow auditory grammar.

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE

Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com) <mailto:[jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com)> , and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of

JEE

Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com) <javascript:\_e(%7B%7D,'cvml','jeevacation@gmail.com');>

, and

destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved

--

please note

The information contained in this communication is confidential, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside information, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the property of JEE Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communication or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by return e-mail or by e-mail to [jeevacation@gmail.com](mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com) <mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com> , and destroy this communication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -all rights reserved