This all needs exposition. sorry. =C2 the computer model for living systems has not led to many conh=rent theories. it does gets misued all the time however, =. the simplest of questions , why does a cell have a symmetric=l shape. extremely complex computations were attempted . did t=e lipids attract. ? if so with what force. ? did the area need to en=lose the greatest volume. . we now know that it is nothing mor= than the most probable shape , given the statistical ensemble available t= it. nothing more. . quantum would attempt to explain it by suggesti=g the molecules took every shape they could and decided on the spherical =ne. . I smile everytime I think of your perception=that there was a magazine called nuzanmirrer.

On Mon, Jun 8, 2015 at 10:1= PM, Noam Chomsky ███████████████████████████████ target=> > wrote:

It's absolutely true that for=study of choice of action, the computer model is not helpful at all. That=E2 s something I've been arguing for many decades, in opposit=on to most physicists these days, who claim that choice of action reduces to =eterminacy and randomness (i.e., programmable). I think it may have =ome up in the Krauss discussion. I also discussed it again in my Dew=y lectures in the J. of Philosophy in December 2013.

I don't frankly see how the S=hrodinger analogy helps in this case.

To clarify, the people I mentioned weren't students working on comp=ters. Rather, professional mathematicians and physicists. The =wo who have been attending seminars for many years, and have published in =reas very closely related to my work, are a mathematician and quantum physicist at Northeastern.

Noam

1

brain as a computer?  as silly as artificial in=elligence.,   The simple example I teach re quantum is whe= i try to decide should i order fish or meat.  for the moment before = order ( as you an I agree ms before i even am concious of ordering. ) both choices  like schroedingers cat exist as a superpost=oned wave function that collapses and  a choice is made.  = yes i am taking liberties. .  the students you referred to you=suggest are working on computers,  not very odd that they might see you I language conforming to their pre perceptions

On Mon, Jun 8, 2015 at 9:41 PM, Noam Chomsky ███████████████ =wrote:

I have a VERY thick skin, and love to=hear criticism.  One of the best ways to learn.  And I'v= often given up closely held beliefs on the basis of persuasive argumentation. =A0 But in this case, I just don't see the arguments.=u>

It's true that the mathematic= lacks rigor, but that's for the same reason that publications in =rofessional math journals lack rigor.  The steps that are not spelled out are str=ightforward enough so that they can be easily filled in.  I don =99t know of any problems about set theory, apart from the classic ones. =A0 Some version of set theory is presupposed in every branch of math, including category theory.  As for the brain as a com=uter, I'm not sure what you see as the problem.  The papers I=sent you do assume that I-language is a computational system, with the pro=erties mentioned, easily formalized.  I don't know of any coherent alternative.  Actually, very good professional mathem=ticians and physicists, one working primarily on quantum computers, have a=tended my regular seminars for years, but I've never heard a sugge=tion as to how mathematical ideas used in quantum theory would be relevant to systems of the kind we're considering.=C2  The "displacement conjecture" is, in fact, an immedi=te consequence of what would be the best possible theory if it's t=ue: SMT, in particular, the assumption that the basic combinatorial operation is the simplest one possible.  Merge is simply set-formatio=, presupposed in all of mathematics.  I agree that it's na =AFve, if by that you mean very simple, arguably optimally so.  But ha=n't that been the pretty explicit goal of science, at least since Galileo, quantum theory included?  I'd like to hear the=objections, and hope to learn from them.

Noam

From: jeffrey E. [mailto:jeevacation@gmail.com]
Sent: Monday, June 08, 2015 3:07 PM
To: Noam Chomsky
Subject:

I will take your word that you share my thick skin f=r criticism and share a strange pleasure in learning, even if it mea=s having to accept that some formerly closely  held beliefs might need strong correction.   I have no particular knowl=dge re politics or history,  so I will never offer an opinion. =owever  re mathematics and or money , I feel on strong ground. =hat being said,  thought puzzles in the paper are brilliant and=insightful.  the mathematical descriptions lack rigor ,  and the metaphors suffer =rom the common science limitation of trying to describe things using the e=gineering metaphors or the tools of  the moment.ex.   The =uman or its brain as a computer ., set theory . It was popular in the early 20th as you know to describe the body as an elect=ic machine..   the mathematics used today in quantum show =ore promise , as it attempts to describe things that appear counter intuit=ve. or difficult to comprehend , ( your displacement conjecture)    your simple  X and Y , Merge , is quit= naive and unfortunately incorrect.

.

2. from the paper you sent. ;  a much more elegant way of conveying =A0 what i had failed to do re sentences and money

European structuralism commonly adopted the Saussurean conception of langua=e  ( MONEY) (in the relevant sense) =s a social entity; as Saussure put it, a storehouse of word images  ( values ) in the brains of a collectivity o= individuals founded on a "sort of contract."

--

please no=e

--

please no=e

--

please =ote

The information contained in this communication is confiden=ial, may be attorney-client privileged, may constitute inside informati=n, and is intended only for the use of the addressee. It is the propert= of JEE Unauthorized use, disclosure or copying of this communica=ion or any part thereof is strictly prohibited and may be unlawful. If =ou have received this communication in error, please notify us immediat=ly by return e-mail or by e-mail to jeevacation@gmail.com <mailto:jeevacation@gmail=com> , and destroy this comm=nication and all copies thereof, including all attachments. copyright -=ll rights reserved